# MEETING OF THE BOARD OF GOVERNORS OF THE STATE BAR OF ARIZONA

February 28, 2020 Phoenix, AZ

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: Brian Y. Furuya, President, Flagstaff; Denis M. Fitzgibbons, President-Elect, Casa Grande; Jennifer Rebholz, Vice President, Phoenix; Jessica Sanchez, Secretary-Treasurer, Tempe; Sandra Bensley, Tucson; Hector Figueroa, Payson; Sharon Flack, Prescott; Robert McWhirter, Phoenix; John Moody, Phoenix; David Rosenbaum, Phoenix; D. Christopher Russell, Sierra Vista; Samuel Saks, Phoenix; Amanda Salvione, Young Lawyers Division; Dee-Dee Samet, Tucson; Sara Siesco, Phoenix; Jimmie Dee Smith, Yuma; Benjamin Taylor, Phoenix; Public Members: Robyn M. Austin, Tucson; John Gordon, Prescott; Jonathan Martone, Paradise Valley; and Anna C. Thomasson, Paradise Valley; and At-Large Members David K. Byers, Phoenix; Lori Higuera, Phoenix; and Doreen McPaul, Window Rock; Victoria Ames on behalf of Douglas Sylvester, Phoenix.

EXCUSED ABSENCES: Mark Harrison, Phoenix; Leticia Marquez, Tucson; Ex-Officio Members Jeffrey Willis, Board Advisor; Dean Mark Miller, Tucson.

OTHERS PRESENT: Deanna Commack, Executive Assistant to CEO/Executive Director; Sarah Corpening, Membership Administrator & Services Manager; Christine Davis, Ethics Counsel; Lisa Deane, Chief Member Services Officer; Tim Eigo, Editor, *Arizona Attorney Magazine*; Joe Hengemuehler, Chief Communications Officer; Joel England, CEO/Executive Director; Candice French, Human Resources Manager; Kathy Gerhart, Chief Financial Officer; Jessica Iennarella, Controller; Supreme Court Liaison Hon. John Lopez, Phoenix; Alex Marlar, Marketing Manager; Lori Maxwell, Chief Information Officer; Richard Palmatier, Assistant General Counsel; Lisa Panahi, General Counsel; Amy Rehm, Deputy Chief Bar Counsel; Carrie Sherman, Director of Board Operations; Karen Van Allen, Administrative Assistant; Maret Vessella, Chief Bar Counsel; Chris Wyatt, IT Lead.

GUESTS: Hon. Peter B. Swann, Arizona Court of Appeals – Division One; Jennifer Albright, Administrative Office of the Courts; David Bell, ABOTA – Phoenix Chapter; Don Bivens, Snell & Wilmer LLP; Kellen Bradley, Levenbaum Trachtenberg PLC; Joe Brophy, Jennings Haug & Cunningham; Jay Calhoun, The Calhoun Law Firm PLC; David Derickson, David G. Derickson PLLC; Amy Ellingson, Office of the Legal Advocate; Angela Enholm, Enholm Law PLLC; Tracy Essig, Essig Law; Matt Fendon, Matt Fendon Law Group; Alvaro Flores, Arizona Bar Foundation; Hope Fruchtman, Law Office of Hope E. Fruchtman; Nancy Greenlee, Sole Practitioner; Andrea Gutierrez, The Angula Law Firm PLLC; Kent Hammand, Rudolph & Hammond LLC; George Hasiotis, Arizona Land and Water Resources LLC; Lynn Keeling, Keeling Law Offices, PC; Elizabeth Langford, The Sampair Group; Shanks Leonhardt, Sanders & Parks PC; John Lincoln, Lincoln & Lauer PLLC; Eric Logvin, Law Office of James R. Vaughan, P.C.; Amy Owen, Owen Law Firm PLLC; Rob Poundstone, Poundstone Scotten, PLLC; Senator Martin Quezada, Law Office of Martin J. Quezada PLLC; Eleanor Satuito, Central Phoenix Law Studio; Franny Sharpe, Arizona Democratic Party; David Telles, Mayes Telles PLLC, Geoffrey Trachtenberg, Levenbaum

Trachtenberg PLC; Debbie Weecks, The Law Office of Debbie Weecks; Terrence Woods, Broenig Oberg Woods & Wilson PC; Mark Zinman, Williams, Zinman & Parham P.C.

President Brian Furuya called the Board meeting to order at 8:33 a.m.

### <u>Call to the Public</u> – President Brian Furuya

President Furuya made a Call to the Public, noting that guests who were present to speak to the recommendations contained in the report of the Task Force on the Delivery of Legal Services ("Task Force") would have an opportunity to speak when this issue came up later on the agenda.

Arizona State Senator Martin Quezada, representing District 29, addressed the Board about the Arizona Commission on Appellate Court Appointments, aware that the Board would be voting on its nominations to send to the Governor to fill three lawyer-commissioner positions. Senator Quezada expressed concern regarding the lack of diversity on the Commission although the Commission's diverse composition is an obligation under the Arizona Constitution, and how the potential lack of diversity could influence the impending work of the Redistricting Commission which is composed of Appellate Commissioners.

### President's Report - Brian Furuya

- Attended (along with CEO Joel England and President-Elect Denis Fitzgibbons) the National Conference of Bar Presidents Mid-Year Meeting in Austin, TX
  - ➤ The ABA is keenly interested in the recommendations contained in the Task Force Report.
  - ➤ House of Delegates Resolution 115 (innovations to address access to justice crisis) was a key issue
- Attended Judge David Gass' Investiture on January 31, 2020
- Listening Tour: Along with CEO England, have held focus groups in:
  - Kingman
  - ➤ Tucson twice; at PCBA Annual Meeting and at the Bar's Tucson office
  - ➤ Phoenix twice at the Bar's offices
  - Tombstone at Old Historic Courthouse; thanks to Chris Russell for hosting
  - Yuma thanks to Jimmie Dee Smith for hosting
  - > Prescott
  - > Upcoming focus groups: Show Low, Flagstaff, and Globe

## **CEO's Report** – Joel England

- Introduced Employee of the Quarter for Fourth Quarter 2019, Alex Marlar. Ms. Marlar was just recently promoted from Marketing Coordinator to Marketing Manager
- Introduced Jessica Iennarella, who recently joined the State Bar of Arizona as Controller
- Thanked Board members who attended the focus groups for their support
- Reported that the Discipline System Oversight Committee held its first meeting

### **10 Minute Topic** – Robert McWhirter

A presentation on the topic of "The Umpires of Rights" was delivered by Mr. McWhirter.

### **POLICY DISCUSSION**

Proposed Bylaw Amendment re: Occasional Virtual Board Meetings – Brian Furuya The Board voted at the December 6, 2019 meeting to direct staff to draft a proposed bylaw amendment which would give the president discretion to designate up to two Board meetings per Bar year as virtual meetings. Said amendment was contained in a Board Reporting Form that was included in the meeting materials. This matter is scheduled for a vote at the April Board meeting as there is no March meeting.

#### **PRESENTATION**

# Overview/Update on the Supreme Court Task Force on the Delivery of Legal Services -

David Byers, Don Bivens and Jennifer Albright

- Presented an overview of the proposed Rule changes in the Petition to Amend Rule 42, of the Supreme Court Rules, ERs 7.1 to 7.5
  - ➤ Problem: Legal fees are out of reach and access to lawyers is difficult
  - ➤ More attorneys doing corporate work
  - > Technology is available people find it online, and it is not regulated
  - ➤ Delivery of Legal Services Task Force recommendations
    - o Limited License Legal Practitioners (LLLPs)

Family Court

Limited Jurisdiction Courts - Civil

Limited Jurisdiction Courts – Criminal

Administrative Hearings

- Law Firm Ownership changing Rule 5.4 to allow for innovation, expanded investment and business models, and partner with other professionals for new services
- Legal Document Preparers (LDPs) modify the program; allow LDPs to answer questions in court; and permit limited legal research
- o Re-emphasize the use of unbundled legal services
- o Modify law firm advertising rules
- o Allow non-attorney domestic violence advocates to assist in courts
- o Allow law school grads limited practice while waiting for Bar results
- ➤ Best model is Ontario, Canada
- ➤ 10 states are looking at aspects of this; Utah is ahead of Arizona
- Two pilot programs in Arizona in place this year
  - 1. Domestic violence non-attorney advocates to assist in court
  - 2. New law school graduates will be able to practice (limited) while waiting for test results
- Statewide public survey with approximately 500 people conducted via land lines and cell numbers by a consultant hired by the Court; survey deemed 98% valid
  - ➤ 80% support the concept of LLLPs
- Timeline:

March 30, 2020 - comments due

April 27, 2020 – working group response

- May 26, 2020 second comments due June 22, 2020 final reply
- There were Board members and guests (see list on pages 3778 and 3779) that wished to
  address the Board during and after the presentation. Speakers were allowed three minutes
  and guests were recognized if they were signed in on a Board of Governors Meeting Speaker
  Request Form.
  - ➤ Hon. Peter B. Swann, a member of the Task Force, spoke about the need to make the system more accessible; did not think the answer to access to justice is to add additional people; the process is moving too fast.
  - ➤ Past President Geoffrey Trachtenberg urged that one or two of the recommendations be selected and rolled out as pilot projects, not all proposals at once (sea change)
  - ➤ Hope Fruchtman has been a sole practitioner in family law for 25 years and has seen document preparers take advantage of clients; they don't have the experience necessary; and then the client is often unable to afford to fix the problem
  - Matt Fendon is a Worker's Compensation Specialist; believes there is access to justice; LDPs have mishandled cases; proposals could create corruption in this area of the law; the Supreme Court's website is not easily accessible
  - Debbie Weecks, a sole practitioner, has completed over 100 hours of pro bono work in order to assist those that cannot afford legal representation have access to justice; shared fees are the same as referral fees; she encourages self-help, if appropriate; she and 19 other members support the points outlined in attorney Denise Blommel's letter
  - Angela Enholm, a family law practitioner, would like the Board to fight for the sole practitioner. She teaches clients how to use the self-help center. Suggested narrowing the scope; try mentoring (as in a Dr.'s residency) and possibly starting with child support and family protection; expand the Modest Means Program. Work of LDPs deplorable.
  - ➤ Jay Calhoun finds it difficult to compete as an African American woman in a small firm and thinks small firms would be hurt the most (by other firms with investors)
  - Eric Logvin, President-Elect of the Creditors Bar Association. As a tech lawyer, supports innovation. Objects to recommendation 1 and recommendation 6 because there is no evidence that it will help close the access to justice gap; no other state had done this; once implemented there is no going back
  - Mark Zinman spoke about the purpose behind the changes. Said the Residential Landlord and Tenant Act has free community legal services help available. His experience is that when a document preparer is on the other side of his matter, it is a larger case which equates to his higher fees
  - Shanks Leonhardt agrees with Judge Swann's position; opposes non-lawyer firm ownership
  - ➤ Kellen Bradley said that changing Rule 5.4 removes protection; it's the "basis of the entire profession"
  - Amy Ellingson thinks that lawyers are *for* their clients. Questioned who is being protected and what are they being protected from. Don't eliminate 5.4

- Tracy Essig: 1) Regarding the cost of bad advice—let's not make the assumption that LLLPs will cost less—this has not been his experience; 2) if 5.4 eliminated an employed lawyer won't go against the owner who may want to work around the rules sometimes; 3) there is no guarantee that LLLPs will provide access to justice; 4) lawyers do perform pro bono work
- ➤ Rob Poundstone: "yeah, it could happen" is an inadequate response being given regarding possible adverse outcomes if recommendations are enacted; resolutions are not being provided by the Task Force; said adverse outcomes are already happening
- Eleanor Satuito agrees that it is necessary to proceed with caution; also believes that with regard to access to justice, those who don't want to pay an attorney is a separate issue from LLLPs; the party with the most resources wins
- ➤ Hon. Dave Derickson (ret.), a former member of the Board of Governors, is opposed to non-lawyers owning part of a law firm; thinks that having LLLPs will not change the chaos

The guests were thanked for taking the time to attend the meeting and provide their comments to the Board on the Court's Task Force's petition, and were urged to do the same online on the Court's website by the comment deadline.

## Appointments Committee Report - Chair Sara Siesco

- a) City of Tempe Judicial Advisory Board
  - The Appointments Committee screened the four new applicants received and recommended that the Board submit the following nominees to the Tempe City Council for its consideration and appointment of one individual: Ms. Martha Ashburn (Solo Practitioners) and Ms. Amanda Chua (Gillespie Shields Goldfarb & Taylor). The Tempe City Council requested three nominations, however, the Committee felt that the two names to be submitted are the most highly qualified candidates.
  - **MOTION**: President Furuya asked if there was any discussion regarding the Committee's report. Hearing none, the Committee's recommendations, requiring no second, passed unanimously.
- b) Rocky Mountain Mineral Law Foundation (RMMF) Trustees Council
  - The Appointments Committee received four applications and, after due diligence reports on the candidates, voted to recommend the following three candidates to the Board of Governors for its appointment to fill one position: Ms. Amy Mignella (Solo Practitioner), Mr. Michael Phalen (Lewis Roca Rothgerber Christie LLP), and Mr. Rob Risley (Freeport-McMoRan Inc.).
  - **MOTION:** Lori Higuera made a motion to appoint Rob Risley based on her experience working with him. Seconded by John Gordon.
  - **MOTION:** Dee-Dee Samet made a motion to appoint Amy Mignella and Jennifer Rebholz seconded the motion.
  - Jimmie Smith requested that the vote be conducted by paper ballot, however President Furuya indicated that he will entertain Board members voting by raising their hands.

• By a vote of 11-9 of the Board, Ms. Amy Mignella was selected to serve a three-year term as the State Bar's representative on the Rocky Mountain Mineral Law Foundation Trustees Council.

# **Special Constitutional Appointments Committee** – Chair Sara Siesco

The Governor of Arizona has requested additional nominations for all judicial nominating commissions except for the newly forming Coconino County Commission on Trial Court Appointments. At the Board Meeting on October 25, 2019, the Committee was directed so resolicit previous applicants, advertise for additional applicants, and interview all applicants.

<u>Arizona Commission on Appellate Court Appointments</u> – The Committee presented the following list of candidates that received votes in order of merit by the Committee based on the criteria contained in the BOG Appointments Policy:

APPLICANTCOUNTYPARTYMs. Silvia R. Arellano, Attorney at Law – 8 votesMaricopaDemocratMr. Todd M. Allison, U.S. Attorney's Office – 7 votesMaricopaDemocratMr. Michael W. Sillyman, Kutak Rock LLP – 6 votesMaricopaDemocratMs. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 6 votesMaricopaDemocratMs. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votesMaricopaRepublicanMs. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votesMaricopaIndependentMr. Daniel B. Sciden, Intel – 4 votesMaricopaRepublicanMr. Daniel B. Sciden, Intel – 4 votesMaricopaRepublicanMr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votesPimaRepublicanMr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Attorney's Office – 4 votesPimaRepublicanMr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votesMaricopaDemocratMr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices – 2 votesMaricopaRepublicanMr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices – 2 votesPimaDemocratMr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 voteMaricopaDemocratMr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 voteMaricopaDemocratMr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 voteMaricopaDemocratMr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 voteMaricopaDemocratMr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 voteMaricopaDemocratMr. Ro			<b>POLITICAL</b>
Mr. Todd M. Allison, U.S. Attorney's Office – 7 votes Mr. Michael W. Sillyman, Kutak Rock LLP – 6 votes Maricopa Ms. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 6 votes Maricopa Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes Maricopa Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes Maricopa Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes Maricopa Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Mr. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices—2 votes Pima Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Democrat	APPLICANT	<b>COUNTY</b>	<b>PARTY</b>
Mr. Michael W. Sillyman, Kutak Rock LLP – 6 votes  Ms. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 6 votes  Ms. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 6 votes  Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes  Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes  Maricopa  Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes  Maricopa  Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes  Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes  Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes  Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes  Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes  Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes  Mr. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes  Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes  Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima  Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC	Ms. Silvia R. Arellano, Attorney at Law – 8 votes	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 6 votes  Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes  Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes  Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes  Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes  Ms. Maricopa  Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes  Ms. Maricopa  Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes  Ms. Maricopa  Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes  Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes  Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes  Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes  Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes  Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes  Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima  Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote  Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat  Democrat  Democrat	Mr. Todd M. Allison, U.S. Attorney's Office – 7 votes	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes Maricopa Republican Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes Maricopa Independent Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Yuma Republican Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes Pima Republican Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Democrat Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima Democrat Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Coconino Democrat Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Independent Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat	Mr. Michael W. Sillyman, Kutak Rock LLP – 6 votes	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes Maricopa Independent Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Yuma Republican Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes Pima Republican Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Democrat Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Pinal Independent Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima Democrat Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Apache Democrat Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Democrat	Ms. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 6 votes	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Mr. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices—2 votes Pima Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC	Ms. Kathleen L. Wieneke, Wieneke Law Group PLC – 5 votes	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes Pima Republican Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes Pima Republican Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Mr. David The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Maricopa Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat	Ms. Maria L. Schaffer, Maricopa Legal Defender's Office – 5 votes	Maricopa	Independent
Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes  Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes  Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes  Maricopa  Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes  Maricopa  Mr. Dinal Independent  Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes  Maricopa  Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima  Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Maricopa  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat  Mr. Davier Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat  Democrat  Democrat  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat	Mr. Andrew F. Halaby, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 4 votes	Maricopa	Independent
Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes Pima Republican Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Democrat Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Pinal Independent Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima Democrat Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Coconino Democrat Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Apache Democrat Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Independent Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Democrat	Mr. Daniel B. Seiden, Intel – 4 votes	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes Maricopa Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Pinal Independent Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima Democrat Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Coconino Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Apache Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Independent Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes: Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat	Mr. David "Wade" Noble, Noble Law Offices – 4 votes	Yuma	Republican
Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes Pinal Independent Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes Maricopa Republican Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices–2 votes Pima Democrat Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Coconino Democrat Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Apache Democrat Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Independent Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Dem	Mr. Christopher L. Straub, Pima County Attorney's Office – 4 votes	Pima	Republican
Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes  Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices—2 votes Pima  Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Mepublican  Republican  Democrat  Republican  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat	Mr. Carlos D. Carrion, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 3 votes	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices—2 votes Pima  Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office — 1 vote  Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA — 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office — 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office — 1 vote  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office — 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC — 1 vote  Maricopa  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC — 1 vote  Maricopa  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC — 1 vote  Maricopa  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat	Ms. Tina L. Vannucci, Fitzgibbons Law Offices PLC – 3 votes	Pinal	Independent
Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices—2 votes Pima  Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office — 1 vote  Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA — 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office — 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office — 1 vote  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office — 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC — 1 vote  Maricopa  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC — 1 vote  Maricopa  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC — 1 vote  Maricopa  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat	Mr. Phillip C. Gerard, The Cavanagh Law Firm PA – 2 votes	Maricopa	Republican
Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote  Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote  Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa  Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat		Pima	Democrat
Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote Apache Democrat Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Independent Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes: Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat	Mr. Ammon D. Barker, Coconino County Attorney's Office – 1 vote	Coconino	Democrat
Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote Maricopa Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote Maricopa Independent Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Maricopa Democrat Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote Pima Republican  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes: Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Maricopa Democrat Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat	Ms. Tonya K. MacBeth, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 1 vote	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote  Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat	Mr. Garrett L. Whiting, Apache County Attorney's Office – 1 vote	Apache	Democrat
Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote  Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote  Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Independent  Maricopa  Democrat  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat	Mr. Jamaar A. Williams, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office – 1 vote	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa Democrat Democrat Democrat	Mr. Hesam Alagha, Herman Goldstein Law Office – 1 vote	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote  Pima Republican  Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat	Mr. Neal H. Bookspan, Jaburg & Wilk PC – 1 vote	Maricopa	Independent
Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:  Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA  Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC  Maricopa  Democrat  Democrat	Ms. Rachel F. Johnson, Rachel Frazier Johnson Law – 1 vote	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Democrat	Mr. Oscar S. Lizardi, Rusing Lopez & Lizardi PLLC – 1 vote	Pima	Republican
Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat Democrat			
Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC Maricopa Democrat	Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:		
	Mr. Robert E. Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Greta Vietor, Federal Public Defender Pima Democrat	Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC	Maricopa	Democrat
	Ms. Greta Vietor, Federal Public Defender	Pima	Democrat
Mr. Brandon J. Kavanagh, Mangum Wall Stoops & Warden PLLC Coconino Independent	Mr. Brandon J. Kavanagh, Mangum Wall Stoops & Warden PLLC	Coconino	Independent
Ms. Abby E. Raddatz, Snell & Wilmer PA Maricopa Republican		Maricopa	Republican
Mr. G. Micah Schmit, U.S. Attorney's Office Pima Independent	Mr. G. Micah Schmit, U.S. Attorney's Office	Pima	Independent

- **MOTION:** Jimmie Smith moved that the Board of Governor's send the list of only the applicants that received votes. Seconded by Hector Figueroa.
- Discussion ensued as to the number of applicants to send forward and where that dividing line would be given the list of candidates.
- President Furuya read the Appointments Committee Policy and Guidelines. The applicants should be vetted by their standing and reputation within the profession and according to diversity and inclusion within the relevant community.

DOLITICAL

- **MOTION:** After a lengthy discussion the motion as stated carried over three dissents.
- President Furuya urged any Board member who has recommendations to change the Committee's process as laid out in the Policy, to bring those ideas to staff's attention.

### Maricopa County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 3

The Committee recommended the following list of constitutionally qualified applicants ranked in order of merit based on the criteria contained in the BOG Appointments Policy:

A DDI ICANITI	Y
<u>APPLICANT</u> <u>PART</u>	_
Mr. Robert W. Shely, Brown Engstrand and Shely LLC – 7 votes Democ	rat
Ms. Karen J. Hartman-Tellez, Ellman Law Group LLC – 5 votes Democ	rat
Ms. Wendi Sorensen, Burch & Cracchiolo PA – 3 votes Democ	rat
Hon. Jonathan H. Schwartz (ret.), Schwartz Mediation – 3 votes Democ	rat
Mr. Javier A. Puig, Lundmark Barberich LaMont & Slavin PC – 2 votes Democ	rat
Ms. Abby E. Raddatz, Snell & Wilmer LLP – 1 vote Republ	ican

• **MOTION:** Coming as a recommendation from the Committee requiring no second, the motion to submit the candidates listed above to the Governor to fill the Supervisorial District 3 seat carried unanimously.

Maricopa County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 4

There were no applicants for this supervisorial district. It covers much of the West Valley.

• **MOTION:** Dee-Dee Samet moved, Jennifer Rebholz seconded and the motion carried unanimously to have the Committee reopen and re-advertise the position.

Maricopa County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 5

The Committee recommended the following list of constitutionally qualified applicants ranked in order of merit based on the criteria contained in the BOG Appointments Policy:

APPLICANT

Ms. Carrie L. Thompson Jones, MacQueen & Gottlieb PLC

Mr. Robert E. Wisniewski, Robert E. Wisniewski PC

POLITICAL PARTY

Independent

Republican

MOTION: Coming as a recommendation from the Committee requiring no second, the
motion to submit the candidates listed above to the Governor to fill the Supervisorial
District 5 seat carried unanimously.

# <u>Pima County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 1</u>

The Committee recommended the following list of constitutionally qualified applicants ranked in order of merit based on the criteria contained in the BOG Appointments Policy:

**POLITICAL** 

	TOLITOIL
APPLICANT	PARTY
Ms. Greta M. Vietor, Federal Public Defender	Democrat
Ms. Carrie L. Rednour, Rednour Law Offices PLLC	Democrat
Mr. G. Micah Schmit, U.S. Attorney's Office	Independent
Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices PLLC	Democrat
Ms. Michele G. Thompson, Udall Law Firm LLP	Republican

### **Executive Session**

- **MOTION:** Dee-Dee Samet moved, Lori Higuera seconded and the motion carried unanimously to go into Executive Session at 12:31 p.m.
- **MOTION:** Dee-Dee Samet moved, Lori Higuera seconded and the motion carried unanimously to return to Open Session at 12:36 p.m.
- **MOTION:** Coming as a recommendation from the Committee requiring no second, the motion to submit the candidates listed above to the Governor to fill the Supervisorial District 1 seat carried unanimously.

# <u>Pina County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 4</u>

There were no applicants for this supervisorial district. It covers much of the West Valley.

• **MOTION:** Dee-Dee Samet moved, Chris Russell seconded and the motion carried unanimously to have the Committee reopen and re-advertise the position.

### Consent Agenda – President Brian Furuya

- Approval of January 24, 2020 Board Meeting Minutes
- Approval of Resignations in Good Standing
- Approval of Reinstatements
- Members Suspended for Non-Compliance with Annual
- Membership Fees and/or Trust Account Compliance
- (Rule 32(c)(10) and/or Rule 43, Ariz. R. Sup. Ct.)
- Members Suspended for Non-Compliance with MCLE
- Requirements (Rule 45, Ariz. R. Sup. Ct.)
- Fee Waiver Denials

President Furuya asked if any item should be removed from the Consent Agenda and, hearing nothing,

• **MOTION:** Denis Fitzgibbons moved, John Gordon seconded and the motion carried unanimously to approve the Consent Agenda.

## Members' Requests for Refunds for Lobbying Activities – Lisa Panahi and Kathy Gerhart

- The Keller-Refund-Request Policy and Procedures was included in the materials for the Board meeting which outlines how a challenge to any State Bar lobbying activity is handled.
- Approximately 43 individual written challenges have been received; 42 objected to the State Bar's participation in an amicus brief relating to the Oregon State Bar and to dismantle its mandatory bar status. The Board of Governors had voted to file said brief. The remaining challenger objected to any lobbying activity conducted by the State Bar during previous Bar year.
- Three options were presented with regard to the 42 challenges:
  - Return the challenges noting that the only challenges addressed under the Policy are related to lobbying, and the amicus brief is not a lobbying activity
  - Advise the challengers that the Bar disagrees that the filing of the amicus brief is non-germane, but in lieu of possible arbitration give a pro rata share of each challengers' membership fees (\$.66/challenger)
  - ➤ Go to arbitration.
- **MOTION:** After discussion, Denis Fitzgibbons moved, Jimmie Smith seconded and the motion carried unanimously to pay each challenger a pro rata refund of \$.66 and based on the Board's decision to avoid the cost of arbitration, per the State Bar's Keller-Refund-Request Policy and Procedures, should not be construed for any other reason.
- It was agreed that an ad hoc group should be formed to look at the arbitration offer noted in the Policy and what Bar-related costs could entail.

### Bankruptcy Section - Request for Support of HR4421 - President Brian Furuya

- HR 4421 was contained in the Board's materials for the January meeting and representatives from the Bar's Bankruptcy Section appeared to request the Board's support of this federal legislation that modifies venue requirements relating to bankruptcy proceedings.
- Hearing no request to discuss the proposal any further,
- MOTION: Dee-Dee Samet moved, Jimmie Smith seconded and the motion carried unanimously to adopt the Resolution before the Board to endorse the passage of HR4421. A letter from President Furuya containing the Resolution will be mailed and emailed to Arizona's elected members of Congress.

# Finance & Audit Committee - Benjamin Taylor and Kathy Gerhart

In connection with the preparation of the State Bar's Return of Organization Exempt Form Tax (Form 990) for the year ended 2019, Board members were requested to complete and return the IRS 990 questionnaire previously sent to each of them.

<u>Status Reports</u> – Lisa Panahi, Joe Hengemuehler, Jessica Sanchez

• Amicus Curiae Matters – Lisa Panahi

- Two cases still at the 9<sup>th</sup> Circuit; waiting on dates for oral argument
- Fleck petition for cert circulated for a March 6 conference
- Legislative Update Joe Hengemuehler

Three Bills of interest to the Bar:

- ➤ SB 1426 (limited liability companies); Senate unanimously approved; awaiting House assignment
- > SB 1274 (professional regulatory boards); voted out of the Senate; now to the House
- ➤ HB 2809 (licensing fees)
- Strategic Planning Working Group Jessica Sanchez
  - Collection of input/comments winding up; included statewide Listening Tour by president and CEO, other targeted focus groups; thanked Board members for participating in the Group's efforts by responding to the survey
  - March 31 meeting to review data collected; next phase to begin drafting Plan

## **2020 Convention** – President Brian Furuya

- Reviewed the Board's Convention Policy; not all Board members are treated the same way under the Policy
- Forms due by April 3 to reserve a room at the Westin La Paloma and tickets for the various social activities

Adjourned at 1:09 p.m.

#### **Executive Session**

The Board moved into Executive Session at 1:09 p.m. to receive the HR Subcommittee Report and the CEO's 2019 Performance Evaluation presented by Subcommittee Chair Anna Thomasson. The Board moved back into Open Session at 1:30 p.m.

**MOTION:** Denis Fitzgibbons moved, John Gordon seconded and the motion carried unanimously to adopt the recommendations of the HR Subcommittee as presented.

Respectfully submitted,

Jessica Sanchez Secretary/Treasurer